# Rigidity of area-minimizing two-spheres in three-manifolds

Hubert Bray, Simon Brendle and Andre Neves

We give a sharp upper bound for the area of a minimal two-sphere in a three-manifold (M,g) with positive scalar curvature. If equality holds, we show that the universal cover of (M,g) is isometric to a cylinder.

#### 1. Introduction

A classical result in differential geometry due to Toponogov [14] states that every simple closed geodesic  $\gamma$  on a two-dimensional surface  $(\Sigma, g)$  satisfies

$$\operatorname{length}(\gamma)^2 \inf_{\Sigma} K \leq 4\pi^2,$$

where K denotes the Gaussian curvature of  $\Sigma$ . Moreover, equality holds if and only if  $(\Sigma, g)$  is isometric to the standard sphere  $S^2$  up to scaling (see also [8] for a different proof).

We next consider a three-manifold (M, g) with positive scalar curvature. By a theorem of Schoen and Yau [13], any area-minimizing surface in M is homeomorphic to either  $S^2$  or  $\mathbb{RP}^2$ . The case of area-minimizing projective planes was studied in [3]. In particular, if  $\Sigma$  is an embedded  $\mathbb{RP}^2$  of minimal area, then the area of  $\Sigma$  can be estimated from above by

$$\operatorname{area}(\Sigma, g) \inf_{M} R \le 12\pi$$

(cf.[3, Theorem 1]). Moreover, equality holds if and only if (M, g) is isometric to  $\mathbb{RP}^3$  up to scaling. A survey of related rigidity results involving scalar curvature can be found in [4].

In this paper, we consider the case of area-minimizing two-spheres. We shall assume throughout that (M,g) is a compact three-manifold with  $\pi_2(M) \neq 0$ . We denote by  $\mathscr{F}$  the set of all smooth maps  $f: S^2 \to M$  which represent a non-trivial element of  $\pi_2(M)$ . We define

(1.1) 
$$\mathscr{A}(M,g) = \inf\{\operatorname{area}(S^2, f^*g) : f \in \mathscr{F}\}.$$

We now state the main result of this paper:

Theorem 1.1. We have

(1.2) 
$$\mathscr{A}(M,g)\inf_{M}R \leq 8\pi,$$

where R denotes the scalar curvature of (M, g). Moreover, if equality holds, then the universal cover of (M, g) is isometric to the standard cylinder  $S^2 \times \mathbb{R}$  up to scaling.

Inequality (1.2) follows directly from the formula for the second variation of area. We now describe the proof of the rigidity statement. By scaling, we may assume that  $\mathscr{A}(M,g)=4\pi$  and  $\inf_M R=2$ . It follows from results of Meeks and Yau [12] that the infimum in (1.1) is attained by a smooth immersion  $f\in\mathscr{F}$  (see also [9]). Using the implicit function theorem, we construct a one-parameter family of immersed two-spheres with constant mean curvature. Using the formula for the second variation of area, we are able to show that these surfaces all have area  $\mathscr{A}(M,g)=4\pi$ . Consequently, these spheres are all round and totally geodesic. This allows us to construct a local isometry from the cylinder  $S^2\times\mathbb{R}$  into M. The use of constant mean curvature surfaces is motivated in part by work of Bray [1] and Huisken and Yau [11] (see also [2, 10]).

We note that Cai and Galloway [5] have obtained a similar rigidity theorem for minimal tori in three-manifolds of nonnegative scalar curvature. The proof in [5] uses a different argument based on a deformation of the metric to strictly positive scalar curvature. The arguments in this paper can be adapted to give an alternative proof of Theorem 1 in [5]. See also [7] for related work in this direction.

## 2. Proof of (1.2)

Let us consider a smooth immersion  $f:S^2\to M$ . Since f has trivial normal bundle, there exists a globally defined unit normal field  $\nu$ . In other words, for each point  $x\in S^2$ ,  $\nu(x)\in T_{f(x)}M$  is a unit vector which is orthogonal to the image of  $df_x:T_xS^2\to T_{f(x)}M$ . The following result is a consequence of the Gauss–Bonnet theorem.

**Proposition 2.1.** For any immersion  $f: S^2 \to M$ , we have

$$\int_{S^2} (R - 2 \operatorname{Ric}(\nu, \nu) - |II|^2) \, d\mu_{f^*g} \le 8\pi,$$

where II denotes the second fundamental form of f.

*Proof.* By the Gauss equations, we have

$$R - 2\operatorname{Ric}(\nu, \nu) - |II|^2 = 2K - H^2,$$

where H and K denote the mean curvature and the Gaussian curvature, respectively. This implies

$$\int_{S^2} (R - 2\operatorname{Ric}(\nu, \nu) - |II|^2) \, d\mu_{f^*g} \le 2 \int_{S^2} K \, d_{f^*g} = 8\pi$$

by the Gauss–Bonnet theorem.

We next consider a map  $f \in \mathcal{F}$  which attains the infimum in (1.1). The existence of a minimizer is guaranteed by the following result.

**Proposition 2.2.** There exists a smooth map  $f \in \mathscr{F}$  such that area  $(S^2, f^*g) = \mathscr{A}(M, g)$ . Moreover, the map f is an immersion.

Proposition 2.2 is an immediate consequence of Theorem 7 in [12] (see also [9, Theorem 4.2]). In fact, Meeks and Yau show that either f is an embedding or a two-to-one covering map whose image is an embedded  $\mathbb{RP}^2$ . We will not use this stronger statement here.

Let  $f \in \mathscr{F}$  be a smooth immersion with area $(S^2, f^*g) = \mathscr{A}(M, g)$ . Using the formula for the second variation of area, we obtain

$$\int_{S^2} (\operatorname{Ric}(\nu, \nu) + |II|^2) u^2 d\mu_{f^*g} \le \int_{S^2} |\nabla u|_{f^*g}^2 d\mu_{f^*g}$$

for every smooth function  $u: S^2 \to \mathbb{R}$ . Choosing u=1 gives

$$\int_{S^2} (\text{Ric}(\nu, \nu) + |II|^2) \, d\mu_{f^*g} \le 0.$$

Using Proposition 2.1, we obtain

$$\operatorname{area}(S^{2}, f^{*}g) \inf_{M} R \leq \int_{S^{2}} (R + |II|^{2}) d\mu_{f^{*}g}$$

$$\leq 8\pi + 2 \int_{S^{2}} (\operatorname{Ric}(\nu, \nu) + |II|^{2}) d\mu_{f^{*}g}$$

$$\leq 8\pi.$$
(2.1)

This completes the proof of (1.2).

## 3. The case of equality

In this section, we analyze the case of equality. Suppose that

$$\mathscr{A}(M,g)\inf_{M}R=8\pi.$$

After rescaling the metric if necessary, we may assume that  $\mathscr{A}(M,g) = 4\pi$  and  $\inf_M R = 2$ . By Proposition 2.2, we can find a smooth immersion  $f \in \mathscr{F}$  such that  $\operatorname{area}(S^2, f^*g) = 4\pi$ .

**Proposition 3.1.** Let  $f \in \mathscr{F}$  be a smooth immersion such that area  $(S^2, f^*g) = 4\pi$ . Then the surface  $\Sigma = f(S^2)$  is totally geodesic. Moreover, we have R = 2 and  $Ric(\nu, \nu) = 0$  at each point on  $\Sigma$ .

*Proof.* By assumption, we have  $\operatorname{area}(S^2, f^*g) = 4\pi$  and  $\inf_M R = 2$ . Consequently, the inequalities in (2.1) are all equalities. In particular, we have

(3.1) 
$$\int_{S^2} (R + |II|^2) \, d\mu_{f^*g} = 8\pi$$

and

(3.2) 
$$\int_{S^2} (\operatorname{Ric}(\nu, \nu) + |II|^2) \, d\mu_{f^*g} = 0.$$

It follows from (3.2) that the constant functions lie in the nullspace of the Jacobi operator  $L = \Delta_{f^*g} + \text{Ric}(\nu, \nu) + |II|^2$ . This implies

$$\operatorname{Ric}(\nu,\nu) + |II|^2 = 0$$

at each point on  $\Sigma$ . Moreover, since  $\operatorname{area}(S^2, f^*g) = 4\pi$  and  $\inf_M R = 2$ , the identity (3.1) implies that R = 2 and  $|II|^2 = 0$  at each point on  $\Sigma$ . This completes the proof.

**Proposition 3.2.** Let  $f \in \mathscr{F}$  be a smooth immersion such that area  $(S^2, f^*g) = 4\pi$ . Then there exists a positive real number  $\delta_1$  and a smooth map  $w : S^2 \times (-\delta_1, \delta_1) \to \mathbb{R}$  with the following properties:

- For each point  $x \in S^2$ , we have w(x,0) = 0 and  $\frac{\partial}{\partial t}w(x,t)\big|_{t=0} = 1$ .
- For each  $t \in (-\delta_1, \delta_1)$ , we have  $\int_{S^2} (w(\cdot, t) t) d\mu_{f^*g} = 0$ .

• For each  $t \in (-\delta_1, \delta_1)$ , the surface

$$\Sigma_t = \{ \exp_{f(x)}(w(x,t)\nu(x)) : x \in S^2 \}$$

has constant mean curvature.

Proof. The Jacobi operator associated with the minimal immersion  $f: S^2 \to M$  is given by  $L = \Delta_{f^*g} + \text{Ric}(\nu, \nu) + |II|^2$ . Using Proposition 3.1, we conclude that  $L = \Delta_{f^*g}$ . Hence, the assertion follows from the implicit function theorem.

For each  $t \in (-\delta_1, \delta_1)$ , we define a map  $f_t : S^2 \to M$  by  $f_t(x) = \exp_{f(x)}(w(x,t)\nu(x))$ . Clearly,  $f_0(x) = f(x)$  for all  $x \in S^2$ . To fix notation, we denote by  $\nu_t(x) \in T_{f_t(x)}M$  the unit normal vector to the surface  $\Sigma_t = f_t(S^2)$  at the point  $f_t(x)$ . We assume that  $\nu_t$  depends smoothly on x and t, and  $\nu_0(x) = \nu(x)$  for all  $x \in S^2$ . Moreover, we denote by  $II_t$  the second fundamental form of  $f_t$ .

**Lemma 3.3.** There exists a positive real number  $\delta_2 < \delta_1$  with the following property: if  $t \in (-\delta_2, \delta_2)$  and  $u : S^2 \to \mathbb{R}$  is a smooth function satisfying  $\int_{S^2} u \, d\mu_{f_t^*g} = 0$ , then

$$\int_{S^2} |\nabla u|^2_{f_t^*g} \, d\mu_{f_t^*g} - \int_{S^2} (Ric(\nu_t, \nu_t) + |H_t|^2) \, u^2 \, d\mu_{f_t^*g} \geq 0.$$

*Proof.* We can find a uniform constant c > 0 such that

$$\int_{S^2} |\nabla u|_{f_t^* g}^2 \, d\mu_{f_t^* g} \ge c \int_{S^2} u^2 \, d\mu_{f_t^* g}$$

for each  $t \in (-\delta_1, \delta_1)$  and every smooth function  $u: S^2 \to \mathbb{R}$  satisfying  $\int_{S^2} u \, d\mu_{f_t^*g} = 0$ . Moreover, it follows from Proposition 3.1 that

$$\sup_{S^2}(\operatorname{Ric}(\nu_t,\nu_t)+|II_t|^2)\to 0$$

as  $t \to 0$ . Putting these facts together, the assertion follows.

**Lemma 3.4.** For each  $t \in (-\delta_1, \delta_1)$ , we have

$$\int_{S^2} (Ric(\nu_t, \nu_t) + |II_t|^2) \, d\mu_{f_t^*g} \ge 0.$$

*Proof.* Since f minimizes area in its homotopy class, we have

$$\operatorname{area}(S^2, f_t^*g) \ge \operatorname{area}(S^2, f^*g) = 4\pi.$$

Moreover, we have  $\inf_M R = 2$ . Applying Proposition 2.1 to the map  $f_t : S^2 \to M$ , we obtain

$$8\pi \le \operatorname{area}(S^{2}, f_{t}^{*}g) \inf_{M} R$$

$$\le \int_{S^{2}} (R + |H_{t}|^{2}) d\mu_{f_{t}^{*}g}$$

$$\le 8\pi + 2 \int_{S^{2}} (\operatorname{Ric}(\nu_{t}, \nu_{t}) + |H_{t}|^{2}) d\mu_{f_{t}^{*}g}.$$

From this, the assertion follows.

By assumption, the surface  $\Sigma_t$  has constant mean curvature. The mean curvature vector of  $\Sigma_t$  can be written in the form  $-H(t) \nu_t$ , where H(t) is a smooth function of t. For each  $t \in (-\delta_1, \delta_1)$ , the lapse function  $\rho_t : S^2 \to \mathbb{R}$  is defined by

(3.3) 
$$\rho_t(x) = \left\langle \nu_t(x), \frac{\partial}{\partial t} f_t(x) \right\rangle.$$

Clearly,  $\rho_0(x) = 1$  for all  $x \in S^2$ . By continuity, we can find a positive real number  $\delta_3 < \delta_2$  such that  $\rho_t(x) > 0$  for all  $x \in S^2$  and all  $t \in (-\delta_3, \delta_3)$ . The lapse function  $\rho_t : S^2 \to \mathbb{R}$  satisfies the Jacobi equation

(3.4) 
$$\Delta_{t^*a}\rho_t + (\text{Ric}(\nu_t, \nu_t) + |II_t|^2)\rho_t = -H'(t)$$

(cf.[10, equation (1.2)]).

**Proposition 3.5.** We have  $area(S^2, f_t^*g) = 4\pi$  for all  $t \in (-\delta_3, \delta_3)$ .

*Proof.* Let  $\overline{\rho}_t$  denote the mean value of the lapse function  $\rho_t: S^2 \to \mathbb{R}$  with respect to the induced metric  $f_t^*g$ ; that is,

$$\overline{\rho}_t = \frac{1}{\text{area}(S^2, f_t^* g)} \int_{S^2} \rho_t \, d\mu_{f_t^* g}.$$

It follows from Lemma 3.3 that

$$\int_{S^2} |\nabla \rho_t|_{f_t^* g}^2 d\mu_{f_t^* g} - \int_{S^2} (\operatorname{Ric}(\nu_t, \nu_t) + |H_t|^2) (\rho_t - \overline{\rho}_t)^2 d\mu_{f_t^* g} \ge 0$$

for all  $t \in (-\delta_2, \delta_2)$ . Moreover, Lemma 3.4 implies that

$$\overline{\rho}_t^2 \int_{S^2} (\operatorname{Ric}(\nu_t, \nu_t) + |II_t|^2) \, d\mu \ge 0$$

for all  $t \in (-\delta_1, \delta_1)$ . Adding both inequalities yields

$$(3.5) \int_{S^2} |\nabla \rho_t|_{f_t^* g}^2 d\mu_{f_t^* g} + \int_{S^2} (\operatorname{Ric}(\nu_t, \nu_t) + |II_t|^2) \, \rho_t \, (2 \, \overline{\rho}_t - \rho_t) \, d\mu_{f_t^* g} \ge 0$$

for all  $t \in (-\delta_2, \delta_2)$ .

In the next step, we multiply Equation (3.4) by  $2\,\overline{\rho}_t - \rho_t$  and integrate. This gives

$$\int_{S^{2}} |\nabla \rho_{t}|_{f_{t}^{*}g}^{2} d\mu_{f_{t}^{*}g} + \int_{S^{2}} (\operatorname{Ric}(\nu_{t}, \nu_{t}) + |II_{t}|^{2}) \rho_{t} (2 \overline{\rho}_{t} - \rho_{t}) d\mu_{f_{t}^{*}g} 
= -H'(t) \int_{S^{2}} (2 \overline{\rho}_{t} - \rho_{t}) d\mu_{f_{t}^{*}g} = -H'(t) \int_{S^{2}} \rho_{t} d\mu_{f_{t}^{*}g}.$$

Putting these facts together, we obtain

(3.7) 
$$H'(t) \int_{S^2} \rho_t \, d\mu_{f_t^* g} \le 0$$

for each  $t \in (-\delta_2, \delta_2)$ . Therefore, we have  $H'(t) \leq 0$  for all  $t \in (-\delta_3, \delta_3)$ . Since H(0) = 0, it follows that  $H(t) \geq 0$  for all  $t \in (-\delta_3, 0]$  and  $H(t) \leq 0$  for all  $t \in [0, \delta_3)$ . Using the identity

$$\frac{d}{dt}\operatorname{area}(S^2, f_t^*g) = \int_{S^2} \left\langle H(t) \, \nu_t, \frac{\partial}{\partial t} f_t \right\rangle d\mu_{f_t^*g} = H(t) \int_{S^2} \rho_t \, d\mu_{f_t^*g},$$

we obtain

$$\operatorname{area}(S^2, f_t^*g) \leq \operatorname{area}(S^2, f^*g) = 4\pi$$

for all  $t \in (-\delta_3, \delta_3)$ . Since f minimizes area in its homotopy class, we conclude that  $\operatorname{area}(S^2, f_t^*g) = 4\pi$  for all  $t \in (-\delta_3, \delta_3)$ .

**Proposition 3.6.** For each  $t \in (-\delta_3, \delta_3)$ , the surface  $\Sigma_t$  is totally geodesic, and we have R = 2 and  $Ric(\nu_t, \nu_t) = 0$  at each point on  $\Sigma_t$ . Moreover, the lapse function  $\rho_t : S^2 \to \mathbb{R}$  is constant.

*Proof.* By Proposition 3.5, we have  $\operatorname{area}(S^2, f_t^*g) = 4\pi$ . Hence, it follows from Proposition 3.1 that  $\Sigma_t$  is totally geodesic, and R = 2 and  $\operatorname{Ric}(\nu_t, \nu_t) = 0$  at each point on  $\Sigma_t$ . Substituting this into (3.4), we obtain  $\Delta_{f_t^*g}\rho_t = 0$ . Therefore, the function  $\rho_t: S^2 \to \mathbb{R}$  is constant, as claimed.

Corollary 3.7. The normal vector field  $\nu_t$  is a parallel vector field near  $\Sigma$ . In particular, each point on  $\Sigma$  has a neighborhood which is isometric to a Riemannian product.

*Proof.* By Proposition 3.6, the lapse function  $\rho_t: S^2 \to \mathbb{R}$  is constant. This implies

$$\begin{split} \left\langle D_{\frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_i}} \nu_t, \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial t} \right\rangle - \left\langle D_{\frac{\partial f_t}{\partial t}} \nu_t, \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_i} \right\rangle \\ &= \frac{\partial}{\partial x_i} \left\langle \nu_t, \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial t} \right\rangle - \frac{\partial}{\partial t} \left\langle \nu_t, \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_i} \right\rangle = \frac{\partial}{\partial x_i} \rho_t(x) = 0 \end{split}$$

for each point  $x \in S^2$ . Moreover, we have

$$\begin{split} \left\langle D_{\frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_i}} \nu_t, \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_j} \right\rangle - \left\langle D_{\frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_j}} \nu_t, \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_i} \right\rangle \\ &= \frac{\partial}{\partial x_i} \left\langle \nu_t, \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_j} \right\rangle - \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} \left\langle \nu_t, \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_i} \right\rangle = 0 \end{split}$$

for all  $x \in S^2$ . Putting these facts together, we obtain

$$\left\langle D_{\frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_i}} \nu_t, V \right\rangle - \left\langle D_V \nu_t, \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_i} \right\rangle = 0$$

for each point  $x \in S^2$  and all vectors  $V \in T_{f(x)}M$ . In particular, we have

$$\left\langle D_{\frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_i}} \nu_t, \nu_t \right\rangle - \left\langle D_{\nu_t} \nu_t, \frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_i} \right\rangle = 0$$

for each point  $x \in S^2$ . Since the vector field  $\nu_t$  has unit length, we conclude that  $D_{\nu_t}\nu_t = 0$ . On the other hand, it follows from Proposition 3.6 that the surfaces  $\Sigma_t$  are totally geodesic. This implies  $D_{\frac{\partial f_t}{\partial x_i}}\nu_t = 0$  for each point  $x \in S^2$ . Thus, we conclude that the normal vector field  $\nu_t$  is parallel. This completes the proof of Corollary 3.7.

We now consider the product  $S^2 \times \mathbb{R}$ , where  $S^2$  is equipped with the induced metric  $f^*g$ . We define a map  $\Phi: S^2 \times \mathbb{R} \to M$  by  $\Phi(x,t) = \exp_{f(x)}(t\nu(x))$ . It follows from Corollary 3.7 that the restriction  $\Phi|_{S^2 \times (-\delta,\delta)}$  is a local isometry if  $\delta > 0$  is sufficiently small.

**Proposition 3.8.** The map  $\Phi: S^2 \times \mathbb{R} \to M$  is a local isometry.

*Proof.* We first show that  $\Phi|_{S^2 \times [0,\infty)}$  is a local isometry. Suppose this is false. Let  $\tau$  be the largest positive real number with the property that  $\Phi|_{S^2 \times [0,\tau]}$ 

is a local isometry. We now define a map  $\tilde{f}: S^2 \to M$  by  $\tilde{f}(x) = \Phi(x,\tau)$ . Clearly,  $\tilde{f}$  is homotopic to f; consequently,  $\tilde{f}$  represents a non-trivial element of  $\pi_2(M)$ . Moreover, we have  $\operatorname{area}(S^2, \tilde{f}^*g) = \operatorname{area}(S^2, f^*g) = 4\pi$ . Therefore,  $\tilde{f}$  has minimal area among all maps in  $\mathscr{F}$ . By Corollary 3.7, each point on the surface  $\tilde{\Sigma} = \tilde{f}(S^2)$  has a neighborhood which is isometric to a Riemannian product. Hence, if  $\delta > 0$  is sufficiently small, then the map  $\Phi|_{S^2 \times [0, \tau + \delta)}$  is a local isometry. This contradicts the maximality of  $\tau$ .

Therefore, the restriction  $\Phi|_{S^2\times[0,\infty)}$  is a local isometry. An analogous argument shows that  $\Phi|_{S^2\times(-\infty,0]}$  is a local isometry. This completes the proof of Proposition 3.8.

Since  $\Phi: S^2 \times \mathbb{R} \to M$  is a local isometry, it follows that  $\Phi$  is a covering map (cf.[6, Section 1.11]). Consequently, the universal cover of (M,g) is isometric to  $S^2 \times \mathbb{R}$ , equipped with the standard metric. This completes the proof of Theorem 1.1.

### Acknowledgments

The authors would like to thank Fernando Marques for discussions, and Willie Wong for comments on an earlier version of this paper.

#### References

- [1] H. Bray, The Penrose inequality in general relativity and volume comparison theorems involving scalar curvature, PhD thesis, Stanford University (1997).
- [2] H. Bray, Proof of the Riemannian Penrose inequality using the positive mass theorem, J. Diff. Geom. **59** (2001), 177–267.
- [3] H. Bray, S. Brendle, M. Eichmair, and A. Neves, *Area-minimizing projective planes in three-manifolds*, Comm. Pure Appl. Math. **63** (2010), 1237–1247.
- [4] S. Brendle, Rigidity phenomena involving scalar curvature, Surveys in Differential Geometry (to appear)
- [5] M. Cai and G. Galloway, Rigidity of area minimizing tori in 3-manifolds of nonnegative scalar curvature, Comm. Anal. Geom. 8 (2000), 565–573.
- [6] J. Cheeger and D. Ebin, Comparison theorems in Riemannian geometry, American Mathematical Society, Providence, RI (2008).
- [7] G. Galloway, Rigidity of marginally trapped surfaces and the topology of black holes, Comm. Anal. Geom. 16 (2008), 217–229.

- [8] F. Hang and X. Wang, Rigidity theorems for compact manifolds with boundary and positive Ricci curvature, J. Geom. Anal. 19 (2009), 628–642.
- [9] J. Hass and P. Scott, The existence of least area surfaces in 3-manifolds, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **310** (1988), 87–114.
- [10] G. Huisken and T. Ilmanen, The inverse mean curvature flow and the Riemannian Penrose inequality, J. Differ. Geom. **59** (2001), 353–437.
- [11] G. Huisken and S.T. Yau, Definition of center of mass for isolated physical systems and unique foliations by stable spheres with constant mean curvature, Invent. Math. 124 (1996), 281–311.
- [12] W. Meeks and S.T. Yau, Topology of three-dimensional manifolds and the embedding problems in minimal surface theory, Ann. Math. 112 (1980), 441–484.
- [13] R. Schoen and S.T. Yau, Existence of incompressible minimal surfaces and the topology of three-dimensional manifolds with nonnegative scalar curvature, Ann. Math. 110 (1979), 127–142.
- [14] V. Toponogov, Evaluation of the length of a closed geodesic on a convex surface, Dokl. Akad. Nauk. SSSR **124** (1959), 282–284

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS
DUKE UNIVERSITY

Durham, NC 27708

USA

E-mail address: bray@math.duke.edu

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS STANFORD UNIVERSITY 450 SERRA MALL, BLDG 380 STANFORD, CA 94305 USA

E-mail address: brendle@math.stanford.edu

IMPERIAL COLLEGE HUXLEY BUILDING 180 QUEEN'S GATE LONDON SW7 2RH

UK

E-mail address: a.neves@imperial.ac.uk

RECEIVED FEBRUARY 24, 2010